BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL SOUTHERN ZONE, CHENNAI

Application No.46 of 2013 (SZ)

IN THE MATTER OF:

Dhayalam Charitable Society Registration No.97/05 Rep. by its President T. Gopi @ Gopalakrishnan No.3/65, Lake View Street Indian Bank Colony Narayanapuram Madurai-625 014

Applicant(s)

AND

 Union of India Ministry of Communication and Information Technology Rep. by its Secretary Electronics Niketan
 CGO Complex Lodhi Road New Delhi.110 003

- Union of India Ministry of Environment Protection & Pollution Control Paryavaran Bhavan CGO Complex, Lodhi Road New Delhi.110 003
- 3. The Telecom Regulatory Authority of India (TRAI)
 Rep. by its Chairman
 Mahanagar Doorsamchar Bhavan
 Next to Zakir Hussain College
 Jawaharlal Nehru Marg
 Old Minto Road
 New Delhi.110 002.
- 4. The State of Tamil Nadu Rep. by its Secretary Department of Environment and Forests – EC For St. George, Chennai.600 009
- 5. Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Rep. by its Member Secretary Chennai, Tamil Nadu.

- 6. The District Collector Madurai District Madurai
- 7. The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Madurai District.
- 8. The President
 Naganakulam Village Panchayat
 Madurai South Taluk
 Madurai District
- 9. The managing Director TATA Tele Services Limited 2nd Floor, M.T. Rajen Properties No.40, Bazzullaha Road T'Nagar, Chennai-600 017

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. S. Subbiah Ms.Jssi Jeeva Priya

Counsel appearing for the Respondents:

Mr. C.V. Ramachandra Murthy for R-1 Smt. S. Seethalakshmi for R-2 Mr. M. Devendran for R-3 Mr. M.K. Subramanian and P. Velumani for R-4 and R-6 Smt. H.Yasmeen Ali for R-5 and R-7 M/s. Abdul Saleem Mr. S. Saravanan and Mrs. Vidhyalakshmi for R-8

Application No.235 of 2013 (SZ)

Malarvizhi W/o. Benzigar No.315/2, South Cotton Road Tuticorin

Applicant(s)

....

AND

- 1. Mr. I. Aswalt C/o. Jeyaseelan No.103, A.J. Cottage Parvar Street, Korkai Srivaikuntam Taluk Tuticorin District
- 2. M/s. Indus Tower Ltd No.1045, 3rd Floor Avinashi Road Coimbatore
- 3. M/s. Bharti Airtel Rep. by its Managing Director Bharti Crescent Nelson Mandela Road Vasant Kunj, Phase II New Delhi.110 070
- 4. The General Manager Tuticorin Circle/Zone B.S.N.L., Tuticorin
- 5. The District Collector District Collectorate, Tuticorin
- 6. The Secretary Ministry of Environment and Forests Govt. of India Paryavaran Bhawan CGO Complex, Lodi Road New Delhi.100 003

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. Ravi Ananda Padmanabhan Mr. M. Purushothaman

Counsel appearing for the Respondents:

Mr. K.S. Sankar Murai and Mr. T.N. Karathikeyan for R-1 to R-3 Mr. K.R. Ramesh Kumar for R-4 Mr. M.K. Subramanian and P. Velumani for R-5 Smt. C. Sangamithrai for R-6

Application No.316 of 2013 (SZ)

A.Chidambaram S/o. Adaikalam Old No.1/200, New No.2008 Subramania Nagar 2nd Street Machuvadi Post Pudukkottai.622 004 Applicant(s) ... AND 1. V. Rajendran S/o. Venkatachalam Old No.1/199 New No. 2007 Subramania Nagar 2nd Street Machuvadi Post Pudukkottai.622 004 2. M/s. Reliance Jio Infocomm Ltd III Floor, Makers Chambers IV 222, Nariman Point, Mumbai.400 021 3. M/s. Reliance Communications Ltd Registered Office, H. Block 1st floor Dhirubhai Ambani Knowledge City Navi Mumbai.400 701 Respondents **Counsel appearing for the Applicant:** M/s.Manoharan and Mr. S. Dakshinamoorthy **Counsel appearing for the Respondents:** Mr. M. Rajenran fo R-1 Mr. V.J. Arul Raj

Mr. Siva Rajasekaran for R-2

M/s. Reliance Communication Ltd for R-3

Application No.5 of 2014 (SZ)

N. Lakshmi Narasimhan S/o. B. Nalla Gounder No.5, Murugan Nagar Raman Nagar Post Mettur Dam, Salem District

Applicant(s)

AND

...

- 1.The Chairman Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Guindy, Chennai.
- 2. The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Salem District, Salem
- 3. The District Collector District Collectorate Salem District
- 4. Union of India Ministry of Communication and Information Technology Department of Telecommunication (Wireless Planning & Co-ordination Wing) 6th Floor, Sanchar Bhavan 20, Ashoka Road New Delhi.110 001
- 5. The Executive Engineer Department of Telecommunications Telecom Building No.2, Bharathi Part Road – II Coimbatore.641 043
- The Executive Officer Veerakalapudhdur Town Panchyat Mettur Dam Salem District
- Reliance Communications Limited A Block, II Floor DAKC, Kopar Khairane Navi Mumbai.400 710

••••

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. Jayaprakash & Mr. Vanangamudi

Counsel appearing for the Respondents:

Smt. H.Yasmeen Ali for R-1 & R-2 Mr. M.K. Subramanian and P. Velumani for R-3 M/s. Abdul Saleem Mr. S. Saravanan and Mrs. Vidhyalakshmi for R-6

> Application No.139 of 2014 (SZ) and M.A. No.260 of 2015

A.S. Ganapathy S/o. K. Sivanu Nadar 49-B, Surya Avenue Chrompet Chennai-44

Applicant(s)

AND

 Union of India Ministry of Communication and Information Technology Rep. by its Secretary Electronics Niketan
 CGO Complex Lodhi Road New Delhi.110 003

 Union of India Ministry of Environment Protection & Pollution Control Paryavaran Bhavan CGO Complex, Lodhi Road New Delhi.110 003 3.The Telecom Regulatory Authority of India (TRAI)
Rep. by its Chairman
Mahanagar Doorsanchar Bhavan
Next to Zakir Hussain College
Old Minto Road
New Delhi.110 002

- 4. The State of Tamil Nadu Rep. by its Secretary Department of Environment and Forests – EC For St. George, Chennai.600 009
- 5. Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Rep. by its Member Secretary Chennai, Tamil Nadu.
- 6. The Commissioner Pallavaram Municipality Pallavaram Chennai.6 00 043
- Reliance Communication Ltd Circle Office, A-1, Tower, 8th Floor 80-90, Dr. Radhakrishnan Salai Mylapore, Chennai.600 004.
- 8. R.M. Manivannan S/o. R.M. Muthu Ground Floor Plot No.49-A, Surya Avenue Chrompet Chennai.600 044
- 9. K. Vijaayasamundeeswari w/o. R.M. Kumaravel First Floor Plot No.49-A, Surya Avenue Chrompet Chennai.600 044

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. K. Chairman Selvaraj and Mr. K.C. Mathan Raj

Counsel appearing for the Respondents:

Shri Su. Srinivan for R-1 and R-3 Mrs. C. Sangamithrai for R-2 Mr. M.K. Subramanian and P. Velumani for R-4 Smt. H.Yasmeen Ali for R-5 Mr. P. Srinivas for R-6 M/s.V.J. Arul Raj Mr. Siva Rajasekaran & Mr. T. N. Karthikeyan for R-7 to R-9

Application No.174 of 2014 (SZ)

Pugazhendhi S/o. Late Ekambaram No.7/4, Gangaiamman Koil Streeta Vadapalani Chennai.600 026

Applicant(s)

AND

1.The Chairman Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Guindy Chennai.

2. The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board No.950/1, Poonnamallee High Road Arumbakkam, Chennai.600 106.

3. Union of India Ministry of Communication and Information Technology Department of Telecommunication (Wireless Planning & Co-ordination Wing) 6th Floor, Sanchar Bhavan 20, Ashoka Road New Delhi.110 001

4. The Commissioner Corporation of Chennai Ripon Building Chennai.

- 5. The Member Secretary Chennai Metropolitan Development Authority Gandhi Irwin Road Egmore, Chennai
- 6. Aircel Cellular Ltd No.769, Spencer Plaza
 5th Floor, Mount Road Chennai.600 002.
- Mani S/o. Veeranadra Achari No.6/5, Gangai Amman Koil Street Vadapalani Chennai.600 026

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. Jayaprakash Mr. Vanangamudi L. Kalaivani

Counsel appearing for the Respondents: Smt. H.Yasmeen Ali for R-1 and R-2 Mr. R. Surya Prakash for R-4 Mr. Raja Srinivas for R-5

Application No.219 of 2014 (SZ)

D. Bala Murali Krishna S/o V. Duraisamy No.207, Nehru Nagar Mettur Dam Salem District

Ap

...

Applicant(s)

AND

1.The Chairman Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Guindy, Chennai.

- 2. The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Salem District, Salem
- 3. The District Collector District Collectorate Salem District
- 4. Union of India Ministry of Communication and Information Technology Department of Telecommunication (Wireless Planning & Co-ordination Wing) 6th Floor, Sanchar Bhavan 20, Ashoka Road New Delhi.110 001

5. The Executive Engineer Department of Telecommunications Telecom Building No.2, Bharathi Part Road – II Coimbatore.641 043

- 6. The Executive Officer P.N. Patty Panchyat Mettur Dam Salem District
- 7. Sukumar Sri Venkateswara Constructions No.92/11, TMP, Nagar Mettur Dam Salem District.
- 8. Reliance Communications Limited A Block, II Floor DAKC, Kopar Khairane Navi Mumbai.400 710

••••

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s. Jayaprakash Mr. Vanangamudi L. Kalaivani **Counsel appearing for the Respondents:**

Smt. H.Yasmeen Ali for R-1 and R-2 M/s.M.K. Subramanian and Mr. P. Velumani for R-3 Mr. Balaji for R-4 and R-5 M/s. S. Hemanth Mr. J. Karunanithi Mr. Shumugavelayutham for R-6

Application No.19 of 2015 (SZ)

IN THE MATTER OF:

- 1. D. Arumugam S/o. Arjuna Pillai No.4, Kavdikarantheru Karanthttankudui Thanjavur
- 2. M. Selvaraj S/o. Mehanathan 1145, Ardiyapillai Agraharam Valayalkara Street Karanthattankudi Thanjavur

Applicant(s)

AND

- 1. Ayyamani @ Gunasekaran Valayalkara Andiyapalli Agraharam Karanthattankudi, Thanjavur
- 2. The Reliance Company Rep. by its Branch Manager VOC Nagar, Thanjavur
- The Chairman & Managing Director TANGEDO Tamil Nadu Electricity Board Chennai.600 002
- 4. Department of Telecommunication Ministry of Communication and Information Technology No.20, Sanchar Bhavan, New Delhi

- 5. Union of India Ministry of Environment and Forests Rep. by its Secretary CGO Complex, Lodhi Road New Delhi.110 003.
- 6. The Chairman Tamil Nadu Pollution Control Board 76, Mount Road Guindy, Chennai.600 032
- 7. The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Door No.3, 4th Cross Street
 Sri Ram Nagar Reddipalayam Road Chanjavur.613 004

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

Respondents

M/s.TaauRs Associates Mr. Kamalesh Kannan Mr. Subramanian Mr. Sai Sathya Jith

Counsel appearing for the Respondents: Mr. Siva Rajasekaran for R-1 and R-2 Mr. Gnanasekaran for R-3 Mr. K. Ramana Moorthy for R-4 Mrs. M.E. Sarashwathy for R-5 Mrs. H. Yasmeen Ali for R-6 and R-7

Application No.127 of 2015 (SZ)

R. Devaraj S/o raman No.53, Ponna Muthu Street Singarathoppu Cuddalore Port-607 003 Tamil Nadu

Applicant(s)

AND

...

- 1. The Secretary Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Indira Paryavaran Bhavan Jor Bagh Road, new Delhi.110 003.
- 2. The Telecom Regulatory Authority of India (TRAI) Rep. by its Chairman

Mahanagar Doorsanchar Bhavan Next to Zakir Hussain College Old Minto Road New Delhi.110 002

- 3. The Member Secretary National Coastal Regulation Zone Authority Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Indira Paryavaran Bhavan Jor Bagh Road New Delhi.110 003
- 4. The Secretary Environment and Forest Government of Tamil Nadu Secretariat, Chennai.600 032
- 5. The Member Secretary Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board No.76, Mount Road Guindy, Chennai-600 032.
- 6. The Chairman State Coastal Regulation Zone Authority O/o. the Environment Department Panagal Building Saidapet, Chennai.
- 7. The Managing Director Tamil Nadu Maritime Board No.171, South Keswavaperumalpuram Greenways Road Raja Annamalaipuram Chennai.600 028
- The Collector and Chairman District Coastal Zone Authaority Cuddalore District Cuddalore.607 001
- The District Environmental Engineer Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board Plot No.A-3, SIPCOT Industrial Complex Kudikadu, Cuddalore.607 005.

10.Gangai Amman Koil Rep. by its President Mr. V. Govindaraj S/o. Veeramauthu Ponna Muthu Street Singarathope Cuddalore- 607 003

11. Vellarimman Koil Rep. by its President Mr. V. Govindaraj S/o. Veeramauthu Ponna Muthu Street Singarathope Cuddalore- 607 003

12. Reliance Jio Infocomm Ltd Registered Office at 3rd Floor Maker Chambers IV
222, Nariman Point Mumbai.400 021 Regional Office No.9, 1st Block 4th Cross Street Anna Nagar, Nellithope Puducherry- 605 005

Respondents

Counsel appearing for the Applicant:

M/s.R. Gururaj Mr. M. Sudarshan

Counsel appearing for the Respondents:

Mrs. M.E. Sarashwathy for R-1 and R-3 Mr. Devendran for R-2 Mr. M.K. Subramanian Mr. P. Velumani for R-4, R-6 and R-8 Mrs. H. Yasmeen Ali for R-5,R-7 and R-9 President, Gangai Amman Kovil for R-10 M. V. Govindaraj, President, Vellari Amman Kovil for R-11 Mr. Arul Raj and Mr. Siva Rajasekaran for R-12

Application No.135 of 2015 (SZ)

Thiyagaraja Nagar Nalasangam Rep. by its President Mr. K. Radhakrishnan Mannai Salai Vilamal-610 004 Applicant(s) **Thiruvarur District** • • • AND 1.The District Collector Tiruvarur District Tiruvarur 2.The Prsident Vilamal Village Panchayat Tiruvarur Panchyat Union Tiruvarur District 3.Mrs. Nirmala W/o B. Rajasekaran Plot No.76 No.3/229, T. Nagar Tiruvarur 4.M/s. Haima 2B, 2nd Floor, Kanaga Ranga Square Alwarpet, Chennai.600 018 Respondent **Counsel appearing for the Applicant:** M/s.V. Sudhakar Mr. K.S. Viswanathan Mrs. Kavitha **Counsel appearing for the Respondents:** M/s. M.K. Subramanian and

Mr. P. Velumani for R-1 Vilamal Village Panchayat for R-2 Ms. S.P. Arthi for R-3 and R-4

ORDER

PRESENT:

HON'BLE SHRI JUSTICE M. CHOCKALINGAM, JUDICIAL MEMBER HON'BLE SHRI P.S. RAO, EXPERT MEMBER

Dated:	5 th February, 2016

Whether the Judgement is allowed to be published on the Internet – Yes/No Whether the Judgement is to be published in the All India NGT Reporter – Yes/No

Heard the counsel for the parties on both sides.

The applicants herein, have sought for the relief in connection with the construction activities of the cell phone towers and also sought for an interim injunction to restrain the construction activities connected to in respect of the cell phone towers more particularly in residential areas on the plea that Electromagnetic Radiation emitted by the towers causes pollution and health hazard to the people. At the time of admission an interim injunction was also granted in a case or two.

The counsel for the respondents have filed their respective reply.

During the pendency of these applications, it was brought to the notice of the Bench that the same subject matter was pending before the Hon'ble Principal Bench, New Delhi and on that ground the applications were adjourned. On the day of last hearing, a copy of the Judgement of the Principal Bench made in Original Application Nos. 61 of 2012, 78 of 2014, 129 of 2015, 147 of 2015, 247 of 2015, 379 of 2015 and 383 of 2015 dated 10.12.2015 was filed. The same is perused. It would be more apt and proper to reproduce Paragraph No.33 of the said Judgement:

"33. In view of the above discussion, we are of the considered view that radiation i.e. Emission of electromagnetic waves from the towers constructed by the respective respondents does not fall within the ambit, scope and jurisdiction vested in this Tribunal under the provisions of the NGT, Act with reference Environment (Protection) Act, 1986."

The Bench has to necessarily follow the decision of the Hon'ble Principal Bench, New Delhi. In view of the decision holding that the construction activities of the cell phone towers by the respondents do not fall within the ambit, scope and jurisdiction vested with the Tribunal under the provisions of the National Green Tribunal (NGT) Act, 2010 with reference to Environment (Protection) Act, 1986, all these applications have got to be necessarily dismissed since they do not arise for consideration before the Bench under NGT Act;, 2010.

Hence, all the applications are dismissed holding that the Tribunal has no jurisdiction to entertain these applications. Accordingly, all these applications are dismissed and interim injunction already granted is vacated. No cost.

> Justice M. Chockalingam Judicial Member

> > P.S. Rao Expert Member